



LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT

BID EVALUATION PLAN

CH0009 – CONSTRUCTION OF NORTH AND SOUTH DAMS

	TITLE	NAME	SIGNATURE	DATE
PREPARED BY:	Contract Administrator	Roy Lewis		
REVIEWED BY:	Package Leader/Area Manager	Mark Turpin		
REVIEWED BY:	Project Manager	Scott O'Brien		
REVIEWED BY:	Deputy Project General Manager	Jason Kean		
REVIEWED BY:	Project General Manager	Ron Power		
APPROVED BY:	Supply Chain Manager	Pat Hussey		



**LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT
 BID EVALUATION PLAN
 CH0009 – CONSTRUCTION OF NORTH AND SOUTH DAMS**

		<u>SIGNATURE</u> (For appropriate Review Tables only)	<u>DATE</u> Day-Month-Year
AGREED BY:	<i>Technical</i>		
AGREED BY:	<i>Health & Safety</i>		
AGREED BY:	<i>Environment</i>		
AGREED BY:	<i>Quality</i>		
AGREED BY::	<i>Risk Assessment</i>		
AGREED BY:	<i>Benefits</i>		


 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0 PURPOSE 2

2.0 BIDDER LIST 2

3.0 SCHEDULE 2

4.0 PROPOSAL SECURITY..... 2

5.0 EVALUATION TEAM..... 4

6.0 EVALUATION PROCESS..... 4

7.0 COMMERCIAL EVALUATION 5

8.0 TECHNICAL EVALUATION 6

9.0 QUALITY EVALUATION 7

10.0 PROVINCIAL BENEFITS EVALUATION 7

11.0 RISK MANAGEMENT EVALUATION 7

12.0 HEALTH AND SAFETY EVALUATION 7


13.0 ENVIRONMENTAL EVALUATION 7

14.0 FINAL ESTIMATED CONTRACT VALUE..... 8

15.0 AWARD PROCESS 8

16.0 NOTIFICATION OF UNSUCCESSFUL BIDDERS 8

17.0 ATTACHMENTS..... 8

 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

1.0 PURPOSE

This document describes the process for receiving, reviewing, and evaluating Proposals including the approach for a Recommendation for Award.

2.0 BIDDER LIST

Request for Proposals (RFPs) were issued to the following 3 Approved Bidders:

- Astaldi Canada Inc.
- Barnard-Pennecon JV
- H.J. O’Connell-Dragados JV


3.0 SCHEDULE

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Due Date</u>
RFP Closing Date	22-October-2014
Bid Opening / Distribute RFP	24-October-2014
Complete Evaluation Process	21-November-2014
Issue Recommendation for Award for Approval	10-December-2014
Receive Approval of Award	17-December-2014
Conform Award Agreement and Route for Approval	17-December-2014
Receive Approval of Award Agreement Document	22-December-2014
Execute Award Agreement to Successful Bidder	23-December-2014

4.0 PROPOSAL SECURITY

Proposals (including priced copies) submitted to the **Contract Administrator** on or before the Bid Closing Date of **22-Oct-2014** will be locked in a secure cabinet/room until the Bid Opening Meeting. Post Bid Opening Meeting the Contract administrator shall be the custodian of the secure cabinet/room(s) and permit access only to authorized Bid Evaluation Team Members by means of a formal sign-out process. All signed-out documents shall be secured by the Bid Valuation Team Member when in the Member’s possession and shall be returned to the Contract Administrator for storage in the secure cabinet at close of business each day.

The Commercial Review Team shall be the only Bid Evaluation Team Members with read access to all of the Bidder Proposal documents. The Package Scope Lead and the

 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

Technical Lead and support team shall have access to the Technical Documents and Tables.

The Technical Lead and Contract Administrator shall advise the Package Scope Lead when all Technical and Commercial Evaluation Tables are complete and rated scores have been determined. At this stage the Package Scope Lead shall direct the Contract Administrator to complete the final Bid Total Value determination and summary worksheets. The Bid Evaluation Team Leads (Package Scope Lead; Contract Administrator; Technical Lead) shall have access to all Bid Evaluation Documents, Tables and Working Papers **only** when final consolidation of each Bid Total Value is determined.

Each Member of the Bid Evaluation Team and his or her designate shall respect the confidentiality of the bid submissions and working papers.

The Commercial Team Lead (Contract Administrator) shall have the right to share bid evaluation information with the Commercial Steering Committee but in a secure and responsible manner. The Commercial Steering Committee will consist of:

Business Services Manager – Lance Clarke


Supply Chain Manager - Pat Hussey

The Package Scope Lead shall have the right to share bid evaluation information with the Technical Steering Committee but in a secure and responsible manner. The Steering Committee will consist of:

Muskrat Falls Corporation

General Project Manager - Ron Power

Project Manager Muskrat Falls Generation - Scott O'Brien

	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

5.0 EVALUATION TEAM

The team responsible for evaluating each Proposal is as follows:

Integrated Evaluation Team (Core)

Representative

Package Scope Lead (Area Manager – CH0009)	Mark Turpin
Commercial	Roy Lewis (Lead); John Mulcahy (Support)
Technical	Abdellah El-Bensi (Lead); Todd Smith (Support)
Quality	Paul Fraser
Risk Management	Carlos Fernandez
Benefits	Maria Moran
Health & Safety	Sean Lee
Environmental	David Haley


6.0 EVALUATION PROCESS

An Overall Scoring Matrix will be used to rank each Bidder’s Proposal. The following criteria will be used to assess each Bidder’s Proposal. Further details of the breakdown of these items can be found in the relevant sections detailed below:

Criteria

Commercial	
Technical	
Quality	Pass/Fail *
Risk Management	Pass/Fail *
Benefits	In Commercial
Health & Safety	Pass/Fail *
Environmental	Pass/Fail *

* Bidders must obtain a score of 70% or greater to pass, however a score of less than 70% is not considered a fatal flaw but shall be used for guidance purposes in the overall Proposal evaluation.

 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

7.0 COMMERCIAL EVALUATION

The Contract Administrator will be responsible for:

- All communications to Bidders during the evaluation process
- Reviewing Proposals to ensure the Bidders have completed all pertinent Appendices (A1 to A17), where applicable
- Distributing the Proposals to the evaluation team
- Issuing and receiving all clarifications
- Arranging Proposal clarification Meetings with Bidders (if required)
- Preparing the Commercial Bid Tabulation
- Managing the Overall Scoring Matrix
- Coordinating the Bidder Execution Plan Review Meeting with each Bidder.


Compliance and/or acceptance with commercial and financial requirements will form an integral part of the commercial evaluation. Commercial acceptance will also be influenced by any exceptions/deviations from the RFP. Any proposed change(s) to the Agreement Articles and/or other Exhibits/Appendices will be negotiated with the Bidders prior to formal review and subsequent acceptance by Legal Counsel.

Each Bidder Total Contract Price (as determined from Appendix A2.1 Schedule of Price Breakdown) will be normalized to a base equivalent bid for each Bidder. Normalising is intended to bring each Bidder Proposal to a common base in the event of Bidder identified deviations and exceptions.

Compliance and/or acceptance with commercial and financial requirements will form an integral part of the commercial evaluation. Commercial acceptance will also be influenced by compliance with the Agreement Articles. Any proposed change(s) to the Agreement Articles will be negotiated with the Bidders prior to formal review and subsequent acceptance by Legal Counsel.

The normalized Proposal Price will be assigned a rating according to differences to the lowest normalized Proposal Price as per the scoring chart shown below:

Score (Rating)	Criteria
10	Low Bidder
9.5	0-5% > Low Bidder
9	6-10% > Low Bidder
8.5	11-15% > Low Bidder
8	16-20% > Low Bidder

 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

7.5	21-25% > Low Bidder
7	26-30% > Low Bidder
6.5	31-35% > Low Bidder
6	36-40% > Low Bidder
5.5	41-45% > Low Bidder
5	46% > Low Bidder

The resulting price will be identified as the Conditioned Contract Price.

The weighted score from the Commercial Evaluation for each Bidder will be applied to the Conditioned Bidder Price to determine the Final Conditioned Contract Price.

Details of the Commercial Evaluation criteria are identified on the appropriate Commercial Evaluation Tables attached in Attachment 1.


8.0 TECHNICAL EVALUATION

The technical evaluation will be carried out by the Technical Representative Team. Technical acceptance will be based on meeting the minimum specified requirements needed to complete the Work. The technical evaluation will be done separately from the commercial evaluation using un-priced copies of the bids.

Following completion of the preliminary evaluation of Proposals, if a Proposal is determined to be significantly non-compliant with the RFP technical documents and/or Technical Specifications, the technical evaluation team will make a recommendation to end the evaluation at this stage and focus all their resources on the evaluation of a technically acceptable Proposal.

During the Bid evaluation process there will be a full day meeting with each Bidder to allow Bidder the opportunity to articulate, in detail, Bidder’s Execution Plan and Proposal Methodology. This meeting will be held at each Bidder’s office and will be attended by the Company Proposal Evaluation Team consisting of the Package Scope Lead; Commercial Lead; Technical Lead and Company Construction Advisor. The Bidder will be expected to have its Proposal team plus the critical nominated construction staff who will be assigned to the work.

Following completion of the preliminary evaluation of Proposals, if a Proposal is determined to be significantly non-compliant with the RFP technical documents and/or Technical Specifications, the technical evaluation team will make a recommendation to end the evaluation at this stage and focus all their resources on the evaluation of a

 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

technically acceptable Proposal.

A summary of the technical evaluation including a statement advising if 1) the Proposal is technically compliant with negotiated and approved deviations or 2) technically non-compliant will be recorded on the Technical Evaluation Report. A technical score will be determined and detailed on the Overall Scoring Matrix for the Proposal. Evaluation of bids which are determined to be non-compliant will be discontinued with the rationale noted in the evaluation.

The Technical submission of each Bidder Proposal will be evaluated based on the pre-established criteria identified in the appropriate Technical Evaluation Tables attached. Refer to the Attachment 1 for the Technical Evaluation Report; Technical Evaluation Summary and the Technical Scoring Matrices.

The weighted Technical score for each Bidder will be given to the Contract Administrator and applied against the Final Conditioned Contract Price.

9.0 QUALITY EVALUATION

The Quality Representative will be responsible for reviewing each Bidder's response to the Quality Questionnaire which was included in the RFP. Refer to the Attachment 1 for the Quality Evaluation Report and Scoring Matrix.

10.0 PROVINCIAL BENEFITS EVALUATION

The Provincial Benefits Representative will be responsible for reviewing each Bidder's response to the Provincial Benefits Questionnaire which was included in the RFP. Refer to the Attachment 1 for the Provincial Benefits Evaluation Report and Scoring Matrix.


11.0 RISK MANAGEMENT EVALUATION

The Risk Management Representative will be responsible for reviewing each Bidder's response to the Risk Management Questionnaire which was included in the RFP. Refer to the Attachment 1 for the Risk Management Evaluation Report and Scoring Matrix.

12.0 HEALTH AND SAFETY EVALUATION

The Health and Safety Representative will be responsible for reviewing each Bidder's response to the Health and Safety Questionnaire which was included in the RFP. Refer to the Attachment 1 for the Health and Safety Evaluation Report and Scoring Matrix.

13.0 ENVIRONMENTAL EVALUATION

 nalcor <i>energy</i> <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

The Environment Representative will be responsible for reviewing each Bidder's response to the Environmental Questionnaire which was included in the RFP. Refer to the Attachment 1 for the Environmental Evaluation Report and Scoring Matrix.

14.0 FINAL ESTIMATED CONTRACT VALUE

The Contract Administrator will determine the Final Total Estimated Contract Value for each Bidder resulting from the application of the final Technical weight ratings of each Bidder Proposal against the Final Conditioned Contract Price.

15.0 AWARD PROCESS

An internal meeting will be arranged to review the completed Evaluation Reports including the priced Commercial Bid Tabulation. If necessary, further negotiation will take place with Bidder(s) to optimize Bidder(s) Proposal(s) to suit Company strategic needs. The successful Bidder will be nominated and will be included in the Team's Bid Evaluation and Award Recommendation. The Bid Evaluation and Award Recommendation will be prepared by the Contract Administrator for sign off and approval by the Bid Evaluation Team. This report will identify the Bidder recommended for Agreement Award including the final negotiated Agreement price(s).


The Bid Evaluation and Award Recommendation, along with all supporting Evaluation Reports, will be routed for review and approval. At the same time, the Bid Evaluation Team will commence preparation of the Agreement documentation including revision of all Commercial and Technical sections, where applicable. The Agreement, comprising of the Articles and Exhibits 1 to 14 inclusive, will be prepared by the Contract Administrator for review and approval. Upon receipt of the approved Bid Evaluation and Award Recommendation and the approved final Agreement, the Agreement will be issued to the preferred Bidder for execution. Authority to commence the Work will be issued after the Agreement has been signed and dated by both Contracting Parties.

16.0 NOTIFICATION OF UNSUCCESSFUL BIDDERS

The Contract Administrator will notify the unsuccessful bidders after the Agreement has been signed by both Parties.

17.0 ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Evaluation Summary and Consolidated Score Sheets

 <small>LOWER CHURCHILL PROJECT</small>	Bid Evaluation Plan	Rev. No.	Date
	CH0009 – Construction of North and South Dams	00	15-Sept-2014

ATTACHMENT 1

Evaluation Summary and Consolidated Score Sheets