Muskrat Falls Corporation Lower Churchill Project Construction of North and South Dams CH0009

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Labour Relations E	valuation
--------------------------	-----------

RFP #: CH0009 RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams			
	RFP #:	CH0009	RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

- 0 Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 Response meets all key criteria
- 5 Response meets and exceeds key criteria

		Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bido	ler 2	Bidder 3	
			Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score
Item	Labour Relations							
1	Labour Union Relationship	20	2	8	4	16	5	20
2	Strike/Lock-out History	10	4	8	4	8	5	10
3	Knowledge of existing local workforce	20	2	8	4	16	5	20
4	Labour Relations Key Personnel	20	2	8	4	16	4	
5	Current experience with existing SPO.	30	1	6	3	18	5	30
				0		0		0
			0			0		0
							·	
	Score Part B	100	38	.00	74	.00	80	.00
11	Total	Percentage	38.00%		74.0	00%	80.00%	

Scored By:	
Date:	

Muskrat Falls Corporation Lower Churchill Project

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Commercial - Summary Evaluation

RFP #: CH0009 RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams		
	RFP #: CH0009	RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

		Question Weight (%)	Bidde	er 1	Bidder 2		Bidd	er 3
			Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score
Item	Commercial Summary							
1	Warranties	10	4	8	2	4	2	4
2	Limit of Liability	15	2	6	4	12	4	12
3	LD Value & Cap	10	1	2	1	2	1	2
4	Proposal Validity	10	5	10	5	10	1	2
5	Rate(s) for extra work & OH&P identified	10	1	2	2	4	1	2
6	Provincial Benefits (BF from table)	5	67.50	3.38	77.00	3.85	79.50	3.98
7	Performance Security (BF from table)	10	56	5.60	80	8.00	68	6.80
8	Insurances (BF from table)	10	68	6.80	68	6.80	68	6.80
9	Co-ordination Procedures (BF from table)	10	74	7.36	80	8.00	80	8.00
10	Financial Data, Staus etc. (BF from table)	10	100	10.00	100	10.00	98	9.80
11	Escalation (if included - normalise in total tender price exercise)							
	Score	100		61.14		68.65		57.38
		Percentage	61.14%		68.65%		57.38%	

Scored By:	
Date:	

- 0 Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 Response meets all key criteria
- 5 Response meets and exceeds key criteria

CIMFP Exhibit P-02761

Page 3
Construction of North and South Dams
CH0009

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

O'Connell-Dragados Barnard-Pennecon Astaldi

Provincial Benefits (including INNU Content) - Labour RFP Evaluations (for use on Civil, Supply & Install, and Services RFPs)

(for use on Civil, Supply & Install, and Services RFPs)

RFP #: CH0009 Title: Construction of North and South Dams

				Weighting	Score	Weighted		Score	Weighted		Score Weig		
Section	Description / Expectation			Assigned	Given	Score	Comments	Given	Score	Comments	Given	Score	Comments
2.1	Contracting and Procuremen	t (7.5%)											
2.1 a)		with implementing local benefits stra	tegies and										
,	agreements, including Aborigi	nal agreements		2.5	5	2.5	k Excavation, Voisey, Waskwa	5	2.5	LCP Wuskawtim	5	2.5	LCP
2.1 b)	Describe Bidder's procuremen	nt policies and procedures that will er	neura reaconable	2.3	J	2.0	K Excavation, voisey, waskwo	,	2.0	ECI Wuskawiiii	J	2.0	EGI
2		community of all procurement opportu											
	,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,											
				2.5	5	2.5	ocal print, direct contact, NLCO	0	5	300 approved local suppliers	5	2.5	Website
2.1 c)		ith NL contractor/supply capabilities.											
	currently familiar with these ca	apabilities, describe proposed steps t	to ensure familiarity										
				2.5	5	2.5	40 years in Province	5	5	In Province since 1970	3	1.5	Little knowledge outside Goose Bay
2.2	Employment (5%)												
2.2 a)	Describe Bidder's familiarity w	ith Newfoundland & Labrador workfo	orce		_			_			_		
2.2 b)	Describe Bidder's human rese	surce policies that will optimize Newfo	a adland and I abreds	2.5	5	2.5	fully engaged, unionized	5	2.5	Unionized	3	1.5	Little knowledge outside Goose Bay
2.20)	employment benefits	dice policies trat will optimize Newto	oundiand and Cabrado										
				1.5	5	1.5	Benefits strategy, PLA	5	1.5	Benefits Strategy, PLA	5	1.5	Benefits Strategy <pla< td=""></pla<>
2.2 c)	Describe Bidder's human reso	eurce policies that will optimize Innu	employment benefits	1.0		0			0			0	
2.3	Gender Equity and Diversity	(5%)											
2.3 a)		ity and diversity plans? If so, describ	e Bidder's policies,										
,	including harassment and disc	crimination policies that support gend	der equity and diversity		_		-	_			_		
0.011	D. Bill I.		·····	1.5	5	1.5	Provided	5	1.5	Provided	5	1.5	Support LCP Divserity Plan
		e policies enable the voluntary identi	fication of members o	1.5	5	1.5	Benefits Reporting	5	1.5	yes	5	1.5	
2.3 c)	Is the Bidder a woman-owned	business?											
				1.0				0	0				
2.3 d)	List any intended subcontract	ors / suppliers that are woman-owner	d business										
				1.0				0	0				
2.4	NL Benefits Reporting (5%)			1.0									
2.4 a)		erience at capturing employment an	d expenditure data as	2.5	5	2.5	LCP	5	2.5	LCP	5	2.5	LCP
		rganization, will be responsible for be		2.5	5	2.5	willie Keats	5	2.5	HR Manager	5	2.5	External Affairs Manager
	Scoring Grid	Scoring Guidance for Section		2.3	J	2.5	Willio IXedia	3	2.0	Til Civialiagei	J	2.5	External Arians Manager
	5	Response meets and exceeds									ł		
	4	Response meets all key									ł		
	3	Response meets a majority of									ł		
	2	Response meets only a few of t									ł		
	1	Response meets none of the									ł		
3.0	Provincial and Innu Content	Response meets none or the	rkey criteria										
3.0 a)	Is Bidder a registered Innu Co	mnonu with IRDC2	Yes = 5 No = 0										
3.0 b)	Use of registered Innu subcon		Yes = 5 No = 0	5.0	-	0	District.		0		-	0	15-4-4
/	Is Bidder an NL Company	uactors?		2.5	5	2.5	Listed	_			5	2.5	Listed
3.0 c) 3.0 d)	Use of NL Subcontractors		Yes = 5 No = 0 Yes = 5 No = 0	5	5	5		5	5			0	
	Bidder has experience workin		Yes = 5 No = 0	2.5	_	0		_	0		_	0	LCP
3.0 e)				2.5	5	2.5		5	2.5		5	2.5	LCP
4.0 a)		SON HOUR ESTIMATE by Residency		25	4	20		3	15		4	20	
	Score = 5	If NL percentage of total hour											
1	Score = 4	If NL percentage of total hours						l					
1	Score = 3	If NL percentage of total hours			8	0%		5:	1%		6	3%	
1	Score = 2	If NL percentage of total hours						l					
	Score = 1	If NL percentage of total hou			_			_			_		
4.0 b)		SON HOUR ESTIMATE by Location of		10	5	10		5	10		5	10	
	Score = 5	If NL percentage of total hour						l					
	Score = 4	If NL percentage of total hours			_						_		
	Score = 3	If NL percentage of total hours			9	9%		8:	82%		9	5%	
	Score = 2	If NL percentage of total hours											
	Score = 1	If NL percentage of total hou	rs is < 20%					—					
5.0	NL BENEFITS CONTENT - EXPE			25	4	20		4	20		3	15	
	Score = 5	If NL percentage of total expendi						l					
	Score = 4	If NL percentage of total expenditu						l					
	Score = 3	If NL percentage of total expenditu			6	0%		7	2%		4	5%	
	Score = 2	If NL percentage of total expenditu						l					
	Score = 1	If NL percentage of total expend	litures is < 20%										
Scored E	By: Maria Moran		Total	100		79.5			77			67.5	
Date:		Sectional		2.5%		1.9875			1.925			1.6875	
			Ranking										

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Commercial - Performance Security

RFP #: CH0009 RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

- 0 Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 Response meets all key criteria
- 5 Response meets and exceeds key criteria

		Question Weight (%)			Bido	ler 2	Bidder 3	
			Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score
Item	Commercial - Performance Security							
1	Performance Bond	40	3	24	4	32	4	32
2	Labour & Material Payment Bond	40	3	24	4	32	4	32
3	Letter of Credit	10	1	2	4	8	1	2
4	Parental Guarantee	10	3	6	4	8	1	2
	Score - transfer to Commercial Summary	100		56.00		80.00		68.00
		Percentage	56.00%		80.0	00%	68.00%	

Scored By:	
Date:	

Muskrat Falls Corporation Lower Churchill Project

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Commercial - Insurances

RFP #: CH0009 RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

- 0 Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 Response meets all key criteria
- 5 Response meets and exceeds key criteria

		Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bidder 2		Bidder 3	
			Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score
Item	Commercial - Insurances							
1	Workers Compensation	20	4	16	4	16	4	16
2	Employers Liability	20	4	16	4	16	4	16
3	Comprehensive General Liability	20	1	4	1	4	1	4
4	Automobile Liability	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
5	Owned & Non-Owned Aircraft	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
6	Property	15	4	12	4	12	4	12
	Property in Transit	15	4	12	4	12	4	12
	Score - transfer to Commercial Summary	100		68.00		68.00		68.00
		Percentage	68.0	00%	68.0	00%	68.0	00%

Scored By:	
Date:	

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Commercial - Coordination Procedures

RFP #: CH0009 RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

Scoring Guide:

- 0 Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 Response meets all key criteria
- 5 Response meets and exceeds key criteria

		Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bidder 2		Bidder 3	
			Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score
Item	Commercial - Coordination Procedures							
1	Key Personnel	12	2	4.8	4	9.6	4	9.6
2	Schedule Development and Control Plan	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
3	Control Schedule	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
4	Control Schedule Baseline Document	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
5	Scheduling and Progress Requirements	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
6	Project execution Plan	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
7	Earned Value Measurement	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
8	Recovery Plan Development **	2	2	0.8	4	1.6	4	1.6
9	Progress Reporting	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
10	Company access to data.	2	2	0.8	4	1.6	4	1.6
11	Bi-weekly Progress Report **	10	4	8	4	8	4	8
12	Monthly Progress Report	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
13	Cost Report	15	4	12	4	12	4	12
14	Change Management - Identification	4	4	3.2	4	3.2	4	3.2
15	Change Management - Pricing	4	4	3.2	4	3.2	4	3.2
16	Change Management - Schedule Impact	4	4	3.2	4	3.2	4	3.2
17	Change Management - Register	3	4	2.4	4	2.4	4	2.4
18	Invoicing Summary Report	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
19	Cash Forecast	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
20	Information Systems/Technology	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
21	Data Transfer	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
22	Document Control	5	4	4	4	4	4	4
	Score - transfer to Commercial Summary	100		73.60		80.00		80.00
	Score - transfer to Commercial Summary							
		Percentage	e 73.60%		80.00%		80.00%	

Scored By:	
Date:	

88 Based on CH0007 performance

BID EVALUATION DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Commercial - Financial Data	
-----------------------------------	--

RFP #:	СН0009	RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

- 0 Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 Response meets all key criteria
- 5 Response meets and exceeds key criteria

		Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bidder 2		Bidder 3	
			Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score
Item	Commercial - Financial Data							
Α	Organisation							
1	Business Organisation	10	5	10	5	10	5	10
2	Joint Venture/Partnership	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3	Business Registration	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
4	Ownership %	10	5	10	5	10	5	10
5	Company/Bidder Relationship	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
В	Financial Data							
1	Financial Responsibility	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
2	Willingness to Guarantee	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3	LOC Maximum Value	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
4	Credit References	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
5	Claims & Judgements	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
6	Bankruptcy	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
7	Contract Cancellation	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
8	Litigation History	5	5	5	5	5	3	3
С	Legal Status							
1	LLC/Corporation	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
2	Partnership	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3	Bank References	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
4	Work Experience Table	Technical						
5	Signing Authority	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
6	Bank Clearance Letter	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
	Score - transfer to Commercial Summary	100		100.00		100.00		98.00
		Percentage			100.00%		98.00%	

Scored By:	
Date:	