

From: [Ken McClintock](#)
To: tonyscott@lowerchurchillproject.ca
Cc: johnmulcahy@lowerchurchillproject.ca
Subject: FW: Modified per telecon
Date: Monday, July 27, 2015 1:40:08 PM
Attachments: [.png](#)
[.png](#)
[Bid Evaluation.CH0009 - Technical Scores - Final MOD.xlsx](#)
[ATT00001.html](#)
Importance: High

Hi Tony

Thanks for the scoring.

But please confirm if the scoring for items 2 and 3 are as displayed. When we talked, I had suggested that item 3 be scored the same on the basis that we did not completely understand what it was referring to. So making them equal would not disadvantage either Bidder.

As for item 2, I thought we agreed that although Bidder 3 **said** that they could meet the milestone dates, our analysis suggested that both the river diversion and North Dam completion were in jeopardy due to the Bidders execution Plan. So are these results not reversed?

Please let me know what you think.

Cheers Ken

Date: Mon, 27 Jul 2015 17:44:24 -0230

To: kgmcclintock@[REDACTED]

From: KenMcClintock@lowerchurchillproject.ca

Subject: Fwd: Modified per telecon

Ken McClintock

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Tony Scott" <TonyScott@lowerchurchillproject.ca>

Date: July 27, 2015 at 4:25:34 PM ADT

To: "Ken McClintock" <KenMcClintock@lowerchurchillproject.ca>, "John Mulcahy" <JohnMulcahy@lowerchurchillproject.ca>

Subject: Modified per telecon

(See attached file: Bid Evaluation CH0009 - Technical Scores - Final MOD.xlsx)

Tony Scott, P.Tech, B.Tech

Sr. Project Planner - Disputes Avoidance

PROJECT DELIVERY TEAM

Lower Churchill Project

t. **(709) 733-6587**

e. TonyScott@lowerchurchillproject.ca

w. muskratfalls.nalcorenergy.com

This email communication is confidential and legally privileged. Any unauthorized reproduction, distribution or disclosure of this email or any attachments is strictly prohibited. Please destroy/delete this email communication and attachments and notify

me if this email was misdirected to you.



BID EVALUATION
DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Technical - Execution Plan Evaluation

RFP #: CH0009

RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

Scoring Guide:

0 - Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
 1 - Response does not meet key Criteria
 2 - Response only meets a few of the key criteria
 3 - Response meets a majority of the key criteria
 4 - Response meets all key criteria
 5 - Response meets and exceeds key criteria

Item	Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bidder 2		Bidder 3		Bidder 3 (1)		
		Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score	
TECHNICAL - EXECUTION PLAN										
1	Mobilization/Demobilization Plan	5	3	3	4	4	4	4	4	4
2	List of Sub-Contractors	3	2	3	3	1.8	4	2.4	4	2.4
3	List of Resources	3	1	0.6	3.5	2.1	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
4	Organization Charts/Key Personnel	3	1	0.6	3.5	2.1	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
5	List of Equipment	2	1.5	0.6	2.5	1	3.5	1.4	3.5	1.4
6	Equipment Maintenance Program	2	2.5	1	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
7	Survey Control Methodology	5	2	2	4	4	4	4	4	4
8	Contractor's Temporary Facilities Layout	2	4	1.6	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2
9	Batch Plants, Crushers and Conveyors Layouts	5	2	2	3	3	2.5	2.5	4	4
10	Crane Strategy and Layout	3	3	1.8	4	2.4	4	2.4	4	2.4
11	Upstream Temporary Bridge Layout	3	2	1.2	5	3	4	2.4	4	2.4
12	Temporary Access Roads and Bridges Layout	3	4	2.4	4	2.4	3.5	2.1	3.5	2.1
13	Method Statement for River Closure	10	2.5	5	3	6	4	8	4	8
14	Method Statement for Jet Grouting	5	4.5	4.5	4	4	4	4	4	4
15	Method Statement for RCC Construction	10	4.5	9	3	6	3	6	4	8
16	Method Statement for CVC Concrete Placement	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
17	Method Statement for Embankment Construction	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
18	Method Statement for Rock Plug Excavation	5	2.5	2.5	3	3	3	3	3	3
19	Method Statement for Dewatering	3	3	1.8	3	1.8	3	1.8	3	1.8
20	Cementitious Material Sources	2	2.5	1	2.5	1	2.5	1	2.5	1
21	Aggregate Production, Stockpiles and Delivery	3	2	1.2	4	2.4	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
22	Cold Weather Protection and Strategy	2	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2
23	Explosives & Blasting Techniques	3	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5
24	Bulk Explosives Source, Transport & Storage	3	5	3	5	3	5	3	5	3
25	Engineering and Shop Drawing Production	3	2	1.2	3.5	2.1	4	2.4	4	2.4
26	Construction Power Monthly Load Requirements	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
27				0		0		0		0
28				0		0		0		0
29				0		0		0		0
30				0		0		0		0
Score - transfer to Technical Summary		100	61.30		70.20		73.60		77.10	
Percentage			61.30%		70.20%		73.60%		77.10%	

Scored By: _____
Date: _____

