

From: tonyscott@lowerchurchillproject.ca
To: johnmulcahy@lowerchurchillproject.ca; kenmcclintock@lowerchurchillproject.ca
Subject: Re: Fw: CH0009 Evaluation Plan
Date: Monday, July 27, 2015 4:36:26 PM
Attachments: [...png](#)
[...png](#)
[Bid Evaluation CH0009 - Technical Scores - Final.xlsx](#)
[Bid Evaluation CH0009 - Technical Scores - Final MOD.xlsx](#)



Bid Evaluation CH0009 - Technical Scores - Final MOD.xlsx

I think that the values for item 3 for bidder 2 & 3,1 were reversed on tab Tech - Schedule

Tony Scott, P.Tech, B.Tech

Sr. Project Planner - Disputes Avoidance

PROJECT DELIVERY TEAM

Lower Churchill Project

t. (709) 733-6587

e. TonyScott@lowerchurchillproject.ca

w. musktratfalls.nalcorenergy.com

This email communication is confidential and legally privileged. Any unauthorized reproduction, distribution or disclosure of this email or any attachments is strictly prohibited. Please destroy/delete this email communication and attachments and notify me if this email was misdirected to you.

John Mulcahy---07/27/2015 01:22:54 PM--- John Mulcahy Hydroelectric Construction Specialist

From: John Mulcahy/NLHydro

To: Tony Scott/NLHydro@NLHYDRO,

Date: 07/27/2015 01:22 PM

Subject: Fw: CH0009 Evaluation Plan

John Mulcahy

Hydroelectric Construction Specialist

PROJECT DELIVERY TEAM

Lower Churchill Project

t. 709 737-4254 c. 709 682 0874

e. JohnMulcahy@lowerchurchillproject.ca

w. musktratfalls.nalcorenergy.com

You owe it to yourself, and your family, to make it home safely every day. What have you done today so that nobody gets hurt?

----- Forwarded by John Mulcahy/NLHydro on 07/27/2015 01:22 PM -----

From: Ken McClintock/NLHydro

To: John Mulcahy/NLHydro@NLHYDRO, Greg Snyder/LCP/NLHydro@NLHYDRO,

Date: 07/27/2015 09:54 AM

Subject: CH0009 Evaluation Plan

Gents

As discussed, here is the original Evaluation Plan spreadsheets for the Technical evaluation. It includes two elements....one for Execution Plan, another for Schedule.

Please complete the Execution Plan spreadsheet based on what we know for Bidders 2 and 3. I will use your evaluation for the final scoring.

John....please agree with Tony on the Schedule component of this evaluation, and provide the scoring to me.

Thanks Ken



Bid Evaluation CH0009 - Technical Scores - Final.xlsx

Ken McClintock

Consultant

PROJECT DELIVERY TEAM

Lower Churchill Project

t. 902 802-1206 c. 902 802-1206

e. KenMcClintock@lowerchurchillproject.ca

w. musktratfalls.nalcorenergy.com

You owe it to yourself, and your family, to make it home safely every day. What have you done today so that nobody gets hurt?

BID EVALUATION
DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Technical - Execution Plan Evaluation

RFP #: CH0009

RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

Scoring Guide:

- 0 - Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 - Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 - Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 - Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 - Response meets all key criteria
- 5 - Response meets and exceeds key criteria

Item	Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bidder 2		Bidder 3		Bidder 3 (1)		
		Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score	
TECHNICAL - EXECUTION PLAN										
1	Mobilization/Demobilization Plan	5	3	3	4	4	4	4	4	4
2	List of Sub-Contractors	3	2	3	3	1.8	4	2.4	4	2.4
3	List of Resources	3	1	0.6	3.5	2.1	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
4	Organization Charts/Key Personnel	3	1	0.6	3.5	2.1	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
5	List of Equipment	2	1.5	0.6	2.5	1	3.5	1.4	3.5	1.4
6	Equipment Maintenance Program	2	2.5	1	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
7	Survey Control Methodology	5	2	2	4	4	4	4	4	4
8	Contractor's Temporary Facilities Layout	2	4	1.6	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2
9	Batch Plants, Crushers and Conveyors Layouts	5	2	2	3	3	2.5	2.5	4	4
10	Crane Strategy and Layout	3	3	1.8	4	2.4	4	2.4	4	2.4
11	Upstream Temporary Bridge Layout	3	2	1.2	5	3	4	2.4	4	2.4
12	Temporary Access Roads and Bridges Layout	3	4	2.4	4	2.4	3.5	2.1	3.5	2.1
13	Method Statement for River Closure	10	2.5	5	3	6	4	8	4	8
14	Method Statement for Jet Grouting	5	4.5	4.5	4	4	4	4	4	4
15	Method Statement for RCC Construction	10	4.5	9	3	6	3	6	4	8
16	Method Statement for CVC Concrete Placement	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
17	Method Statement for Embankment Construction	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
18	Method Statement for Rock Plug Excavation	5	2.5	2.5	3	3	3	3	3	3
19	Method Statement for Dewatering	3	3	1.8	3	1.8	3	1.8	3	1.8
20	Cementitious Material Sources	2	2.5	1	2.5	1	2.5	1	2.5	1
21	Aggregate Production, Stockpiles and Delivery	3	2	1.2	4	2.4	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
22	Cold Weather Protection and Strategy	2	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2
23	Explosives & Blasting Techniques	3	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5
24	Bulk Explosives Source, Transport & Storage	3	5	3	5	3	5	3	5	3
25	Engineering and Shop Drawing Production	3	2	1.2	3.5	2.1	4	2.4	4	2.4
26	Construction Power Monthly Load Requirements	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
27				0		0		0		0
28				0		0		0		0
29				0		0		0		0
30				0		0		0		0
				0		0		0		0
Score - transfer to Technical Summary		100	61.30		70.20		73.60		77.10	
Percentage			61.30%		70.20%		73.60%		77.10%	

Scored By: _____
Date: _____

BID EVALUATION
DISCIPLINE SCORE SHEETS

RFP - Technical - Execution Plan Evaluation

RFP #: CH0009

RFP Name: Construction of North and South Dams

Scoring Guide:

- 0 - Question not answered or no relevant information provided in response
- 1 - Response does not meet key Criteria
- 2 - Response only meets a few of the key criteria
- 3 - Response meets a majority of the key criteria
- 4 - Response meets all key criteria
- 5 - Response meets and exceeds key criteria

Item	Question Weight (%)	Bidder 1		Bidder 2		Bidder 3		Bidder 3 (1)		
		Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score	Answer	Score	
TECHNICAL - EXECUTION PLAN										
1	Mobilization/Demobilization Plan	5	3	3	4	4	4	4	4	4
2	List of Sub-Contractors	3	2	3	3	1.8	4	2.4	4	2.4
3	List of Resources	3	1	0.6	3.5	2.1	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
4	Organization Charts/Key Personnel	3	1	0.6	3.5	2.1	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
5	List of Equipment	2	1.5	0.6	2.5	1	3.5	1.4	3.5	1.4
6	Equipment Maintenance Program	2	2.5	1	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
7	Survey Control Methodology	5	2	2	4	4	4	4	4	4
8	Contractor's Temporary Facilities Layout	2	4	1.6	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2
9	Batch Plants, Crushers and Conveyors Layouts	5	2	2	3	3	2.5	2.5	4	4
10	Crane Strategy and Layout	3	3	1.8	4	2.4	4	2.4	4	2.4
11	Upstream Temporary Bridge Layout	3	2	1.2	5	3	4	2.4	4	2.4
12	Temporary Access Roads and Bridges Layout	3	4	2.4	4	2.4	3.5	2.1	3.5	2.1
13	Method Statement for River Closure	10	2.5	5	3	6	4	8	4	8
14	Method Statement for Jet Grouting	5	4.5	4.5	4	4	4	4	4	4
15	Method Statement for RCC Construction	10	4.5	9	3	6	3	6	4	8
16	Method Statement for CVC Concrete Placement	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
17	Method Statement for Embankment Construction	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
18	Method Statement for Rock Plug Excavation	5	2.5	2.5	3	3	3	3	3	3
19	Method Statement for Dewatering	3	3	1.8	3	1.8	3	1.8	3	1.8
20	Cementitious Material Sources	2	2.5	1	2.5	1	2.5	1	2.5	1
21	Aggregate Production, Stockpiles and Delivery	3	2	1.2	4	2.4	4.5	2.7	4.5	2.7
22	Cold Weather Protection and Strategy	2	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2	3	1.2
23	Explosives & Blasting Techniques	3	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5	2.5	1.5
24	Bulk Explosives Source, Transport & Storage	3	5	3	5	3	5	3	5	3
25	Engineering and Shop Drawing Production	3	2	1.2	3.5	2.1	4	2.4	4	2.4
26	Construction Power Monthly Load Requirements	2	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6	4	1.6
27				0		0		0		0
28				0		0		0		0
29				0		0		0		0
30				0		0		0		0
				0		0		0		0
Score - transfer to Technical Summary		100	61.30		70.20		73.60		77.10	
Percentage			61.30%		70.20%		73.60%		77.10%	

Scored By: _____
Date: _____

