

**From:** [Carter, Paul](#)  
**To:** [Coffey, Bernard \(Clerk of the Executive Council\)](#)  
**Subject:** RE: New Document: MFG Project Unit #2, Pour D2ESB-03, Draft Tube Formwork Collapse Investigation Report Available on Oversight Committee 2016  
**Date:** Saturday, April 22, 2017 11:06:33 AM

---

Bern,

Many issues which may have contributed to the failure but does not delineate any one specifically. Could have been one factor or a combination of many. Focus appears to be primarily on formwork support towers but also identified problems with other elements of the form work as well. Observations rely in part from other draft tubes given that significant portions of the DT2 formwork were buried in hardened concrete.

Contributing factors include:

Poor design specifications,

Poor fabrication of before install,

Poor installation,

Poor material handling and effects of significant weathering on the formwork

In my view, the authors appear critical of the entire situation right from engineering design to signoff of installed formwork.

Exact words in the conclusion read:

“The findings of this report suggest that one of the following occurred:

- I The shoring system was not designed properly
- ii Wood integrity of the formwork was compromised
- iii The shoring system was not installed correctly
- iv the shoring system fabrication system was inadequate
- V A combination of the aforementioned factors

There are many potential issues discussed within the report which may have influenced the load-carry capability of the shoring system:

- The shoring tower’s capability was under-designed
- The tower leg lumber splices could have been inadequate
- The form work installation may have been deficient.
- The integrity of the wood material could have been compromised.”

I cannot print a copy. I will have to track one down. I will also check on what the comm plan is on this. You can give me a call if you get a chance. 691 6503 Thanks, Paul

Paul Q. Carter  
Executive Director – Muskrat Oversight Committee  
Cabinet Secretariat, Executive Council  
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador  
PO Box 8700  
St. John’s, NL  
A1B 2Z8  
Phone: 709-729-3681  
Email: [paulcarter@gov.nl.ca](mailto:paulcarter@gov.nl.ca)

---

**From:** Coffey, Bernard (Clerk of the Executive Council)  
**Sent:** Friday, April 21, 2017 6:32 PM  
**To:** Carter, Paul  
**Subject:** Fw: New Document: MFG Project Unit #2, Pour D2ESB-03, Draft Tube Formwork Collapse Investigation Report Available on Oversight Committee 2016

Paul:

In short, what does the report say?

Bern

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

---

**From:** Nalcor Energy <[publications\\_comments@intralinks.com](mailto:publications_comments@intralinks.com)>  
**Sent:** Friday, April 21, 2017 3:28 PM  
**To:** Coffey, Bernard (Clerk of the Executive Council)  
**Reply To:** IntraLinks  
**Subject:** New Document: MFG Project Unit #2, Pour D2ESB-03, Draft Tube Formwork Collapse Investigation Report Available on Oversight Committee 2016

## A New Document Is Available

A new document is now available in the Oversight Committee 2016 exchange.

### Note from Nalcor Energy

(no note included)

## View Document: MFG Project Unit #2, Pour D2ESB-03, Draft Tube Formwork Collapse Investigation Report

Exchange: Oversight Committee 2016  
Folder: [DT Number 2](#)

Copyright © 2000 - 2017 IntraLinks, Inc. All Rights Reserved

### Contact IntraLinks Support

New York/ US: +1 212 543 7800  
Toll free in the US: 888 546 5383  
London: +44 (0) 20 7623 8500  
UK Freephone: +800 3434 5656  
[support@intralinks.com](mailto:support@intralinks.com)

### Quick Links:



[Alert Settings](#)



[Email Support](#)



[Retrieve  
ID/Password](#)